

**BROOKLYN COLLEGE
OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK**

FACULTY COUNCIL

February 19, 2013

- (5953) Call to order The fifth meeting of Faculty Council for the 2012-2013 academic year was called to order at 3:30 pm in the Woody Tanger Auditorium by the chair, Professor Langsam (CIS).
- (5954) Roll call The roll call was taken at the door. Department Chairs and Representatives: Sharman (Anthro & Archeao), Hadler (Art), Ciszowska (Chemistry), Cheng (E&ES), Cherry (Economics), Troyansky & Rawson (History), Bonaffini (Modern Lang.), Wasser (TV& Radio); School Delegates: Estey (Humanities & Social Sci.), Grubbs (Visual, Media & Performing Arts) were absent (-11); Bankoff (Anthro & Archeao) Johnson (Physical Ed.), Ungar (Political Sci.) Perez y Gonzalez (PRLS), Lenzer (Children & Youth Sci.), Menser (Humanities & Social Sci.), Ball (Visual Media & Performing Arts) were excused (-7); Administrators: Faria, Green, Hewitt were also absent and excused. All other members were present.
- (5955) Minutes of October 16, 2012 & November 13, 2012 Professor Langsam presented the minutes of December 11, 2012. The minutes were approved.
- (5956) Steering Committee Professor Langsam announced a change of agenda. A report from the Committee on College Integrity was added to Reports of Standing Committees.
- Professor Langsam read minutes for Professor Emeritus Bart Meyers (Psychology), Professor Emeritus Mordecai Gabriel (Biology), Professor Emeritus John Scheffler (Theatre), Professor Emeritus Bernard Pollack (Physical Education), Ms. Sandi Pollock (Physical Education), and Mr. George Bonn (Metropolitan Food Director). Faculty Council observed a moment of silence.
- Professor Langsam announced the special election for a member of the Committee on Committees.
- (5957) Communications from the Administration Provost Tramontano opened for the administration. He stated that he wished everyone a great spring semester. President Gould sent her regrets, as she was unable to attend Faculty Council due to a meeting of the search committee for the Dean of the School of Public Health.
- Senior Vice President for Finance and Administration Giovannelli welcomed the new Assistant Vice President for Facilities Fitzgerald. He was identified through a search committee chaired by Vice President for Enrollment Management Joyner. AVP Fitzgerald has spent significant time at NYU and Columbia. Early in his career, he worked at the Brooklyn Borough President's Office. SVP Giovannelli stated that he was delighted that AVP Fitzgerald was at Brooklyn College and that his responsibilities include oversight, planning, operations, and maintenance. SVP Giovannelli stated that a high priority for his office was the improvement of communication with the campus community and that his office's website will be revamped. He declared that he wanted to make sure that the community understands the status of capital projects in the fairly significant portfolio of work on the Brooklyn College campus. The portfolio consists of project for which, in some cases, resources were identified years ago. Programmatic projects include the following:
- The Tow Center for Performing Arts: Current work is below grade. The foundation and excavation work are on schedule. The framework of the building will rise in the

next few months.

The Science Building: Planning is underway for this large multimillion dollar project. This is a complicated building that involves science and teaching spaces. When the planning process is finished, Brooklyn College will be in a better position to address financing.

Ingersoll Omnibus project: Work will be done on biology labs, infrastructure work on the ventilation system, and nutrition spaces. Planning is moving rapidly and the project will begin in the fall. There will be 10-15 projects in Ingersoll, which will be done piece by piece, to make it a much more effective and functional science space.

Film Studio at Steiner Studios: Brooklyn College is beginning the process of building a state-of-the-art film teaching facility. It is finalizing the terms of the lease.

TV Studio: The high definition studios in the Whitehead basement are nearing completion.

Whitman Basement: Planning work to address leaks has begun. This infrastructure work will help rationalize program space.

Infrastructure projects include the following:

West Quad: Brooklyn College will address ventilation, heating, and cooling. The replacement of glasswork, which was improperly designed or installed, will be underway in the next few months.

Campus: There will be a major, multiyear project to replace security and fire alarm systems.

Boylan and Ingersoll: The replacement of slate roofs will begin in order to address, leaks. The roofs will be fully restored in this long-term, multi-year project.

James Hall: The cornice will be replaced as will light wells.

The Provost then spoke. He stated that President Gould is very appreciative of statements of support from faculty and from Committee on College Integrity. She is eager and looking forward to the review of the events of February 7 conducted by the Chancellor and Senior Vice Chancellor Schaffer and outside counsel. At the previous week's Policy Council, the President called for a review of policies and procedures about student-sponsored events. Over the weekend, the President was in Albany making sure communication is on track with elected officials.

The search for Associate Provost of Academic Programs is underway. Chaired by Professor Pipe (Psychology), the committee has been working feverishly, along with colleagues from the search firm Witt-Keifer. The committee is at the airport interview stage. Eight candidates will be interviewed at the airport interviews, and four finalists will be brought to campus. The Provost thanked the members of the committee.

The search for the Associate Dean for the School of Business is under way. There are seven finalists at the airport interview stage. Of that number, there will be four finalists. Professor Walker (Library) is chairing the committee. The Provost stated that he hoped that the search would conclude by the middle of April.

The Provost urged faculty members to register for CUNY First. He thanked VP Joyner and his staff for behind-the-scenes work in scribing for Pathways. The Provost declared that he would say more about Pathways and CUNY First at the March meeting of Faculty Council. Almost every one of Brooklyn College's Pathway's courses has gone forward through the committees at CUNY with the exception of the Individual and Society Bucket. The last material is due by end of the week. The Provost stated that Brooklyn College would engage in a review of general education in the fall of 2013. What is in place now is a placeholder and there will be many fruitful discussions about general education requirements. The Provost stated that it was critical to develop a richer and deeper culture of

outcomes assessment at Brooklyn College. He stated that work would be done with individual departments to develop solid plans for outcomes assessment. Brooklyn College looked good in the past Middle States review, because it focused on two or three stellar departments. Now, Middle States is making a purposeful bid to have everyone understand that outcomes assessment belongs to all at the department and institutional levels. The Provost encouraged everyone to play a major role in outcomes assessment. A brief discussion of outcomes assessment and CUNY First training followed.

(5958) Committee on Professor Shortell (Sociology) presented the following nominations: Professor Braine (Sociology) for Chair of the Committee on Academic Integrity, Professor Davis (Music) for the Committee on Admissions, Professor Kaya for the Committee on Undergraduate Curriculum, Professor Porter (FBM) for the Committee on Graduate Admissions and Standards, Professor Bowyer (Music) for the Committee on Honors, Citations, & Awards, Professor Warren (History) as Chair of the Committee on Library, Professor Clarke (FBM) for the Committee on Master Planning, Education Policy & Budget. All were elected.

(5959) Liaison with Professor Fox (English) read the following report about the most recent University Faculty Senate meeting.

I. Guest Speaker

Matthew Sapienza, Associate Vice Chancellor for Budget and Finance, spoke about the proposed CUNY budget for 2013-14 (The CUNY fiscal year goes from July 1 to June 30). Some details are that Governor Cuomo has recommended for the senior colleges an increase of \$95.6 million, or 4.6%, which includes \$34 million to cover increased cost of fringe benefits, like health care costs, and money to cover TAP financial aid waivers. The VC explained that TAP will pay up to \$5000 a year per student, but full-time tuition is going to up about \$5400 a year, so colleges can pay that extra \$400 per student for students receiving full financial aid. The increased money available to CUNY is largely due to the \$300 increase in tuition (There has been an agreement that CUNY tuition can be increased by \$300 a year for the next 5 years). The VC reported that about 50% of CUNY students attend CUNY tuition free. Also, last year, \$5 million was added to the CUNY budget for such student assistance initiatives as buying expensive course texts to be made available in college libraries, offering more job opportunities to students on campus, and tuition waivers. This year, CUNY will ask for \$10 million for these sorts of initiatives. There has also been an increase in money available to two-year colleges. Special grants will be available to the two-year colleges as part of a "job linkage program," which will consider such factors as the number of students completing degree or certificate programs, the number of students who are employed after completing their degree or certificate programs, the number of "on time" completion of degree or certificate programs, and the number of transfer to other colleges. The Governor recommends no changes to TAP, which is good, because past governors have often recommended cutting TAP. It should however be remembered that TAP is only available to students for 8 semesters of college study, and many CUNY students take up to 6 years to graduate. However, federal PELL grants will pay for up to 12 semesters of college study.

About enrollment, the VC reported that Fall '12 undergraduate enrollment was down about 3% in the two-year colleges, but this was planned, as the population of these colleges was growing beyond their capacity. Senior college undergraduate enrollment held steady in Fall '12 and Spring '13, but graduate enrollment was down about 5%. This is perhaps because of reduced enrollment in education programs, which is perhaps because teaching positions in the city are being cut. Colleges are encouraged to develop graduate programs in areas where jobs are available.

II. UFS Chair report

UFS Chair, Terry Martell, reported that there is a new "CUNY Challenge Program" that "will provide \$55 million in capital funding per year over the next five years. The competitive process is open to all CUNY senior colleges, graduate and professional

schools, community colleges and/or multiple campus consortiums. Awards of \$5 M to \$25 M will be made to support transformational projects that meet the four key pillars outlined in the New York City Regional Economic Council Strategic Plan: improve quality of life; create a pro-growth, pro-jobs environment; invest in the future; and foster innovation and inter-regional cooperation.

About Pathways, the Chair said that we are waiting for decisions from the courts about the PSC legal challenges to Pathways. The Chair approved of the recent statement of the BMCC Faculty Senate, which said that Pathways was illegal because the CUNY administration is trying to impose changes in curricula which have not been approved by faculty governance bodies (You may remember that Yedidiah Langsam, our own Faculty Council Chair, made a statement to that effect at our last Brooklyn College Faculty Council meeting).

A number of UFS members expressed concern about the recently released Kroll report about the recent political protest event at Baruch College, where a number of demonstrators were arrested by NYC police. UFS representatives felt that this report, which was paid for by the CUNY administration, was, not surprisingly, biased in presenting an inaccurately positive description of the role of the Baruch administration, and an inaccurately negative description of the role of the demonstrators. A criticism of the Kroll report can be found in an article entitled "12 Things to Know about the Kroll Report," which can be found on the "Occupy CUNY" website. This article, not surprisingly, says about the Kroll report that "Key events are falsely described." Perhaps the truth can be found somewhere between the report and the article. I will be happy to send links for both the report and the article to anyone who wishes to read them.

III. Resolution on Academic Freedom

The UFS Committee on Academic Freedom wrote the following resolution related to the recent BDS controversy at Brooklyn College, which was passed without dissent (57 yes, 1 abstain):

Resolution of the UFS Academic Freedom Committee

The UFS supports the academic freedom of the Brooklyn College community in the matter of the program organized by Students for Justice in Palestine and co-sponsored by the Department of Political Science.

The University Faculty Senate deplors attacks on the Department of Political Science for co-sponsoring a presentation on a controversial issue, as well as attacks on the faculty and the administration of Brooklyn College for supporting the Department.

To assume that co-sponsoring a presentation means uncritical endorsement of one side or another would impose an ideological litmus test on all controversial debates. Academic Freedom is the core ethos of the University.

Passed without dissent by the CUNY University Faculty Senate on Feb. 5, 2013.

(5960) Degree Lists Degree Lists 2013/19, 20, 21 & 22 were presented by Professor Langsam and were approved with a vote of 77 yeas, 0 nays, and 2 abstentions.

(5961) Report of Committee on Undergraduate Curriculum & Degree Requirements: Professor Standing Committees Tenenbaum (CIS) presented Curriculum Document 360 with changes. The document passed with a vote of 79 yeas, 0 nays, and 0 abstentions.

Committee on Graduate Curriculum & Degree Requirements: Professor Gargan (Library) presented Curriculum Document 212, which passed with a vote of 75 yeas, 0 nays, and 0 abstentions.

Committee on Honorary Degrees: Professor Gao (Psychology) presented its annual report, which was accepted.

Committees on Graduate Admissions & Standards and Course & Standing: Professors Chu (H & NS) and Cohen (Music) presented the Resolution to Discontinue the Use of the ABS Grade, Absent from the Final, by Brooklyn College. After a discussion, the resolution passed with a vote of 66 yeas, 1 nay, and 2 abstentions.

Committee on Course & Standing: Professor Cohen presented the Resolution to Modify the Undergraduate Bulletin after Approval of the Resolution to Discontinue the Use of the ABS Grade, Absent from the Final, by Brooklyn College. The resolution was approved with a vote of 68 yeas, 0 nays, and 0 abstentions.

Committee on College Integrity: Professor Moses (English) presented the following report:

The Faculty Council's Committee on College Integrity and Academic Freedom was convened to respond to the controversy surrounding the Feb. 7 campus event featuring two speakers who advocate for the Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions movement against Israel.

We praise President Gould for her steadfast defense of academic freedom and academic integrity. We thank her for her courageous stand in the face of enormous pressure.

We oppose the politically opportunistic, deplorable threat by certain elected officials to reduce funding to Brooklyn College and to CUNY in general if the event were held. Yielding to such attempted coercion would have compromised academic freedom throughout the university and shattered its reputation for integrity.

We call upon the President to clarify further for the public and college community the meaning of various terms used in academia concerning what it means to sponsor, endorse, support, host or fund an event.

We call on the college to do a thorough transparent and speedy review of procedures and circumstances surrounding the staging of the Feb. 7 event – particularly the decision to have security officers escort four students off the premises, which appears to have been unjustified.

We hope that after a thorough review, procedures will be established so that the principles of academic freedom and integrity remain as the foundation upon which the College is based.

Thank you.

Yedidyah Langsam, Computer and Information Science

Paul Moses, English (chairman)

Maria Perez y Gonzalez, Puerto Rican and Latino Studies

David Owen, Psychology

Florence Rubinson, School Psychology, Counseling, and Leadership

Professor Sardy (Economics) commented that the report did not reflect the feeling of some faculty that the President did not defend academic freedom. Professor Bank Muñoz (Sociology) commented that she was concerned about the phrase “which appears to have been unjustified.” She asked if the committee had come to a conclusion in advance of the review. Professor Rubinson (SPCL) stated that she would be willing to take that point back to the committee. Professor Yarrow (Classics) moved to accept the report. Professor Bell (FBM) moved to postpone the acceptance of the report. A discussion followed. Professor Gargan called the question. The question was called with a vote of 60 yeas and 10 nays. The vote to postpone the acceptance of the report failed with a vote of 21 yeas, 54 nays, and 3 abstentions. Vice President for Institutional Advancement Sillen asked about the fourth paragraph, which appeared to cede to the President to the clarification of the terms of sponsorship, support, endorsement, hosting, and funding. The committee

added the phrase "to work with Policy Council" following "We call upon the President" in the fourth paragraph. Professor Florence (SEED) commented on the phrase "appears to have been unjustified." Professor Moses stated that he thought the phrase was important because it stood as a timely response to the event. Professor Tremper (English) stated the committee had not adjudicated the questions of procedure and circumstance but had adjudicated the question of the removal of the students. Professor Moses declared that the committee focused on removal of the students because of the attention that removal received. Professor Lipke (Biology) stated the phrase "appears to have been unjustified" stands without support and asked the committee to remove that phrase. Professor Aja (PRLS) asked the committee to remove the phrase. Professor Day (Africana) stated that the faculty would like a speedy response but that there were problems with the wording of the report. Professor Lipke moved to amend the motion to accept the report to a motion to accept the report with the exception of the phrase "which appears to have been unjustified." The question was called with a vote of 52 yeas, 9 nays, and 0 abstentions. The resolution to accept the report without the phrase "which appears to have been unjustified" passed with a vote of 41 yeas, 19 nays, and 1 abstention.

(5962)Old Business There was no old business.

(5963)New Business There was no new business.

(5964) Adjournment There being no further business, the Chair declared the meeting adjourned at 5:00 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Yedidyah Langsam,
Chair

Martha Nadell,
Secretary