

REVISED
 BROOKLYN COLLEGE
 OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK
 FACULTY COUNCIL

March 8, 2016

- (6244) Call to order The sixth meeting of Faculty Council for the 2015-2016 academic year was called to order at 3:30 pm in the Woody Tanger Auditorium by Professor Langsam (CIS).
- (6245) Roll call The roll call was taken at the door. Department Chairs and Representatives: Bankoff (Anthro & Archae), Basil (Biology), Ciszowska (Chemistry), Cheng (E&ES), Stern (History), Girelli-Carasi (Mod Lang), Adams (SEED); School Delegate: Rubinson & Zolkower (Edu.), Vitale (Humanities & Soc Sci.), Dexter (Nat. & Bev. Sci.) were absent (-11) were excused (0); Administrators: Carey, Moore, Hopkins, Gilbert, Fitzgerald, Hewitt, Gold & Ali were also absent and excused. All other members were present.
- (6246) Minutes of February 16, 2016 The minutes of February 16, 2016 were approved unanimously.
- (6247) Steering Committee Professor Langsam led a moment of silence for Professor Shakin (Physics). He read the following, in part:
 Carl Shakin, former Distinguished Professor of Physics, passed away on Feb. 20, 2016 at the age of 82. Carl joined the Department of Physics from Case Western Reserve University as a full Professor in 1973, and became Distinguished Professor in 1986. He was a well-known figure in the field of theoretical nuclear physics. He also served as the Chair of the Physics Department from 1984 to 1987 and from 2002 to 2003, and retired in 2004. Prof. Shakin's colleagues view him as a brilliant scientist, visionary and one with a great imagination. He led a vibrant research group at Brooklyn College and made significant contributions to the field of nuclear physics. He published over 200 papers and coauthored a book on '*Relativistic Nuclear Physics: Theories of Structure and Scattering*'. Before joining Brooklyn College, he was Professor at MIT and Case Western Reserve University. He received his MA and PhD from Harvard University. He was a Fellow of the American Physical Society. Carl leaves behind two daughters Susan and Elisabeth, and four grandchildren. According to his family, he was an avid reader who enjoyed music, movies, theater, good food, and all that New York has to offer. We pray for his soul to rest in peace.
- Professor Langsam announced that the elections for the University Faculty Senate would be held on line during the week of March 14, 2016.
- Professor Langsam announced that, at the following meeting of Faculty Council, a special election for the positions of Acting Secretary of Faculty Council and one at-large member for the 2016-2017 academic year to fill in for Professors Nadell (English) and Perez y Gonzalez (PRLS).
- Professor Langsam announced that nominations for a panel of up to six members for the Brooklyn College Association Board will take place at the following meeting.

REVISED

(6248) Communications
from the Administration

President Gould provided an update about the New York State budget. She stated that there is now finally some conversation about the thinking of New York City Mayor Di Blasio and the New York City Council about the proposed shift of either the full amount or a portion of the CUNY budget from New York State to New York City. She discussed the budget timeline. During the current week and the following one, the New York State Assembly and Senate will meet in committee to create their budgets, which should be available for review by the end of the second week of March. Hopefully, there will be some agreement about the budgets, which should be available by the end of the third week of March. We may, however, not have a clear picture of the budget. New York State Governor Cuomo has stated that students will not feel the brunt of the proposed budget. President Gould then discussed the financial situation at Brooklyn College and other CUNY campuses. Brooklyn College has stuck with its plan of not cutting the adjunct budget. Brooklyn College has tried to stay within the parameters of budget reductions, so we should end the year in a good position, without huge deficits. However, we don't know what that budget will look like. President Gould stated that Brooklyn College is doing well, because we are all suffering. We have achieved our goals, and we will not be in a catastrophic state. In fact, there are some CUNY campuses where the Coutra funds have been nearly wiped out, which is a very bad situation to be in. If we had no reserves and if we experience further cuts, it would be very painful. If the compact does not pass, there will be no new funds, unless the Legislature finds some funds for CUNY.

President Gould then turned her attention to the events of the previous Faculty Council meeting. She discussed why she initiated a review of what happened. She has the authority and responsibility under the Henderson Rules to uphold the CUNY by-laws, which include policies that address public assembly and protest. She stated that she is a realist and pragmatist and knows, from having gone through this before, that if we did not review this, someone else will from outside Brooklyn College. She stated that it was better for us to take a look at our own house with sympathy and empathy and understanding of the context. She thanked those who participated and hoped that students will too, so they can have a voice. This is not overly heavy handed or meant to be in any way mean spirited. This is meant to be an educational experience. Professor Shortell (Sociology) thanked President Gould for the explanation of the context of the fact-finding. He asked, given the need to take this as a teaching moment, if President Gould would commit to resources for meetings, perhaps in conjunction with Faculty Council, where we could have conversations about how we discuss contentious issues. These meetings could be an opportunity for students, faculty, and staff to come together under the rubric of civility, where we learn that the appropriate response is more speech, not less. President Gould responded that she appreciated the question and that there had been a good conversation about this at CAP. There are many faculty who want to find ways beyond classes to address these issues. Experiential learning is one way of addressing this. She is pleased to offer support in terms of food and venue and co-hosting. President Gould stated that she was not going to host or organize these events, however, because part of what students are not learning outside of the classroom is how to have these conversations with each other, faculty and staff. She declared that she does not think that a town hall meeting, where students air their grievance one-by-one, would be effective. She reported that, in fact, the day before the Faculty Council meetings, the CUNY College Presidents had a substantial conversation with the Chancellor about these challenges. When you have many different points of view, great diversity – whether it be backgrounds, religion, race, or political points of view – the issue of getting across differences in respectful ways can be challenging, the President stated. She continued that there are ways we can be passionate but find a way to be civil, despite the fact that, in today's culture and especially with some of these difficult issues, the very notion of civility is

REVISED

under attack. She said that we need to be models for our students, and to help them see and watch how we communicate with each other, so they can see that we can completely disagree on an issue and still talk about it in a respectful manner. That is, in fact, in our mission statement. She urged anyone with ideas about how to be engaged in this type of effort to let Nicole Haas, Chief of Staff to the President, know. She stated that she is willing to help as much as possible, but she wants this to come from faculty, because students look up and listen to faculty. Faculty members have the capacity to have inroads into the thinking of students and can help them learn what the parameters for this type of interaction are, so, when they leave here, they will be well-prepared for what is coming next. We can overprotect them, if we allow them to believe that their actions have no consequences, she declared. Professor Wills (History) stated that while faculty play an important role with regard to students, students feel invisible to the administration. Professor Wills asked for President Gould's reaction to this sentiment. President Gould stated students should feel welcome. This is, she stated, a large campus with 17,000 students, which is why Brooklyn College has an administration that works with students in a variety of capacities. Professor Wills responded that students look up to President Gould as the leader, but they feel that what they care about doesn't matter and that they are chastised about speaking up about what is important to them. President Gould stated that she has rarely chastised students and that they have been given a large venue for expressing their views. She declared that she has been active in protecting student rights and faculty rights. In the fundamentals, she has been on the side of students during her entire tenure at Brooklyn College. There are lots of ways to reach out and she listens and, if she can, she acts and does something, although she may not always report her actions publically. A great number of students concerns are raised in the Office of the President, and Chief of Staff Haas deserves recognition for addressing them, often by identifying the appropriate person to address those concerns. President Gould stated that she thinks that students do know that the administration has focused not only on understanding their needs but also on helping them remain at Brooklyn College and graduate in a timely fashion. Professor Estey (Political Science) asked about the relationship between the Brooklyn College fact-finding and the investigation ordered by Chancellor Milliken, at the behest of outside people. President Gould stated that the Brooklyn College fact-finding is being led by Director of Student Engagement and Judicial Affairs Cunningham, Director of Diversity and Equity Programs Mason-Kinsey, and Pam Pollack, Legal Counsel to the President, who are making headway and who will provide President Gould with their assessment of what transpired. The Chancellor has called for a review of campus climate, civility, and strands of alleged anti-semitic behavior on four campuses, as a result of receiving a letter from the Zionist Organization of America. President Gould reminded Faculty Council that she responded that day after the event, a week before the ZOA issued its statement. Professor Langsam stated that Faculty Council Steering has charged the not-yet-formed General Education committee to look into these issues as part of General Education at Brooklyn College. He thanked President Gould for her commitment to support educational events that meet our mission. Professor Raphan (CIS) asked if the Brooklyn College fact-finding review is being coordinated with that of the Chancellor. President Gould responded that they are totally separate.

Provost Tramontano stated that Brooklyn College received a letter from Middle States stating that Brooklyn College had been reaccredited, because it had opened another site (the Film School at Steiner Studios). He also reminded Faculty Council that the Monitoring Report, which deals primarily with institutional effectiveness and assessment, is due on April 1, 2016. He thanked Acting Assistant Provost Pipe for taking on this responsibility, along with many members of the academic affairs team, as well as the steering and assessment committees. He thanked CUNY Central for its review of the documents. This document will be sent within

REVISED

the next two weeks. Faculty will find it on the Brooklyn College portal.

Provost Tramontano reminded Faculty Council that, in 2011 when Deans began at Brooklyn College because of its five-school structure, he made a commitment that, five years hence, he would give the full time faculty an opportunity to review their school's Dean. Three have reached five years of service, so members of faculty in their three schools will receive summary statements about their Dean's accomplishments, a questionnaire, and a place for comment. These will be used for personnel evaluations conducted by the President and Provost.

Provost Tramontano reported that, in response to the COACHE survey, five small committees will be formed to address some of the issues raised. Although many issues are above the level of local control, this will be an opportunity to get feedback. In the next weeks, he will work with Professors Langsam and Marsh (Theater) to come up with small groups that may consist of four faculty members and one administrator. This will continue into the 2016-2017 academic year.

Provost Tramontano reported on the search for the Associate Dean of the Library. He noted that Acting Director Kramer is doing a great job. Currently, there are eight semi-finalists, who will be narrowed to four finalists for campus visits. The search for the Associate Provost for Institutional Planning and Assessment currently has eight finalists, who will be narrowed to four finalists for campus visits. He thanked Associate Provost Moore for leading the library search as well as former Associate Provost Cheng and Dean Conelli for leading the Associate Provost search. Professor Estey (Political Science) asked about the Library Report. The Provost stated that he will discuss that at the April Faculty Council meeting.

(6249) Committee on Committees

Professor Shortell (Sociology) presented the Resolution to establish a General Education Committee, which was approved with a vote of 92 yeas, 3 nays, and 0 abstentions. He then presented a list of nominations to Faculty Council committees. The secretary cast 1 vote for the election of the nominees. A special election was held to fill a vacant seat on the Committee on Committees. Professors Lin (Finance), Bassell (Business), and Elizalde-Utnick (SPCL) were nominated. They received 18, 29, and 41 votes, respectively, and Professor Elizalde-Utnick was nominated.

(6250) Liaison with the University Faculty Senate

Professor Queneau (BuMa), the liaison with the University Faculty Senate, reported on the UFS meeting of February 2, 2016. The guests were Chancellors Milliken, Vice Chancellor for Budget and Finance Sapienza, and Senior Vice Chancellor and Board Secretary Hershenson. They reported on the budget. At the time of the meeting, New York State Governor Cuomo had released the executive budget. The budget included the possibility of increasing tuition every year in the amount of \$300 (this policy is now called the predictable tuition plan). Governor Cuomo's budget also included a proposal to give \$240 million for retroactive pay if New York City took over 1/3 of the CUNY budget, in the amount of \$485 million, reflecting the fact that 1/3 of the Board of Trustee members are New York City appointees. Chancellor Milliken spoke about the impasse in terms of negotiation of the contract. CUNY has notified the Public Employment Relations Board of the impasse; CUNY and the PSC-CUNY will enter non-binding mediation. The Chancellor spoke about the letter he received from New York State regarding the high level of administrative salaries at CUNY and SUNY. Only three of the fifty highest paid New York State employees are employed by CUNY. The Chancellor agreed that CUNY should address inefficiencies. Senior Vice Chancellor Hershenson spoke about the CUNY value campaign, which includes outreach to legislators to address the budget situation.

REVISED

- (6251) Degree Lists Professor Langsam reported that the Steering Committee of Faculty Council approved Degree Lists 2016/8 & 9, due to the events at the February meeting of Faculty Council. Degree List 2016/10 was approved unanimously.
- (6252) Report of Standing Committees
 Committee on Undergraduate Curriculum & Degree Requirements: Professor Cohen (Music) presented Curriculum Document 379, 380, and 381 with changes. Curriculum Documents 379 and 380 were approved with a vote of 80 yeas, 2 nays, and 2 abstentions. A discussion of Curriculum Document 381 followed. Professors Childers (MLL) described changes in the document, compared to the previous document. Professor Langsam reminded Faculty Council that faculty members will not scribe courses. Professor Estey asked if CUNY Central directed the content of the document. Professor Childers responded that that was not the case; the division between the Humanities and Social Sciences courses, for example, was due to the large block of undifferentiated courses into the category. Professor Hainline (Psychology) stated that a committee should make a motion to allow Brooklyn College to recognize Pathways, especially since two faculty committees worked diligently on the new General Education model. Professor Langsam stated that the Steering Committee of Faculty Council would not make that motion, but that any individual may make that motion. Professor Shortell stated that there are two issues; we should address governance and faculty control of the curriculum directly, but we should discuss this document on its merits. Professor Raphan asked how the new General Education model differs from Pathways. Professor Childers stated that the categories differ in significant ways. Professor MacIntyre (Music) pointed to the hard work that went into developing Brooklyn College categories. The document was approved with a vote of 70 yeas, 4 nays and 4 abstentions.
- Committee on Graduate Curriculum & Degree Requirements: Professor Evans presented Curriculum Documents 231 & 232, which were approved with a vote of 69 yeas, 0 nays, and 1 abstention.
- Committee on Honorary Degrees: Faculty Council was informed of the President's selection of honorary degree recipients, which had been approved by the committee.
- Computer Utilization & Educational Technology: The annual report was presented and accepted.
- (6253) Old Business There was no old business.
- (6254) New Business There was no new business.
- (6255) Adjournment There being no further business, Professor Langsam declared the meeting adjourned at 5:04 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Yedidyah Langsam
Chair

Martha Nadell
Secretary